

Why Anaphora Constraints Are Not Syntactic

Claudia Brugman and George Lakoff

Nobody would ever call her before noon, who knows anything about Louise's weird sleeping habits.

*Somebody called her up yesterday who didn't know about Louise's sleeping habits.

Nobody ever mentioned to her that Louise was going to be nominated.

*John mentioned to her yesterday that Louise was going to be nominated.

*Nobody ever mentioned to her that the committee was going to nominate Louise.

*Somebody mentioned to her that the committee was going to nominate Louise.

*He would be lonely if John won the lottery.

Under no circumstances would he be lonely if John won the lottery.

For no reason would he be lonely if John won the lottery.

*For no reason he would be lonely if John won the lottery.

Nobody ever asked her if Louise approved of the deal.

OK/?I never asked her if Louise approved of the deal.

*John asked her if Louise approved of the deal.

?Nobody ever told her about Louise's uncle's death.

*John told her about Louise's uncle's death.

Nobody ever gave her a gift that Louise really liked.

?John gave her a gift that Louise really liked.

*John gave her the vase that Louise really liked.

*A woman met him in Chicago who went to school with Dan's mother.

No one would ever want him in class who had Dan's brother as a student.

Nobody can tell her that Louise should get a better lawyer.

*Nobody ought to tell her that Louise should get a better lawyer.

Nobody can bring himself to tell her that the lawyer Louise hired is a shyster.

*John managed to get himself to tell her that the lawyer Louise hired is a shyster.

*Under no circumstances would I ever tell her that Louise hired a shyster.

Under no circumstances could anyone convince her that Louise had hired a shyster.

Under no circumstances could anyone convince her that the lawyer Louise hired was a shyster.

In none of Louise's apartments does she keep a pet tarantula.

*In none of Louise's apartments does she keep her pet tarantula.

*In one of Louise's apartments, she keeps a pet tarantula.

*In one of Louise's apartments, she keeps her pet tarantula.

Mary hit him before John had a chance to get up.

*Mary hit him just before John managed to get up.

@Mary hit him before John managed to get up.

*Mary hit him before John got up.

Only rarely did we see her after Louise got married.

*Occasionally we saw her after Louise got married.

*On state occasions we saw her after Louise got married.

*We saw her after Louise got married.

?We saw her often after Louise got married.

We saw her only rarely after Louise got married.

*/?We saw her every day after Louise got married.

*Her husband beats Louise.

Under no circumstances would her husband beat Louise.

*On Tuesdays her husband beat Louise.

Only her husband would even think of beating Louise.

*Her husband thought of beating Louise.

It isn't likely that anyone will see her much after Louise gets married.

*It is certain that John will see her regularly after Louise gets married.

Predicted to be good by c-command:

*It is inconceivable to her that John hired Louise.

*It angers her that John wants to fire Louise.